

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE GRIEVANCE REDRESSAL COMMITTEE HELD ON 16-04-2019.AT 1530hrs TO REDRESS THE GRIEVANCES OF THE BIDDERS, AS PER RULE 67 OF PUNJAB PROCUREMENT RULES, 2014 (AMENDED), FOR PREQUALIFICATION OF MANAGEMENT AND OPERATIONS OF RURAL AMBULANCE SERVICE FOR IRMNCH & NP FOR FY 2018-19.

A meeting of the Grievance Redressal Committee was held on 16-04-2019 at 1530hrs in committee room of Director General Health Service Punjab, 24-Cooper Road, Lahore to redress the grievances of the bidders, as per Rule 67 of Punjab Procurement Rules, 2014, for PREQUALIFICATION OF MANAGEMENT AND OPERATIONS OF RURAL AMBULANCE SERVICE_for IRMNCH & NP for Financial Year 2018-19. The Director General Health Services, Punjab chaired the meeting.

2. Following members of Grievance Redressal Committee attended the meeting:

1	The Director General Health Services, Government of the Punjab, Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department	In-Chair
2	The Program Director, IRMNCH & Nutrition Program, Government of the Punjab, Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department	Member
3	The Co-opted Member O/o the Director General Health Services, Government of the Punjab, Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department	Member

3. Following members of the Bid/Technical Evaluation Committee presented the case to the grievance redressal committee:

1	The Additional Director (Procurement), IRMNCH & Nutrition Program, Government of the Punjab, Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department
2	The Prequalification Specialist-I, Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department
3	Logistics Officer IRMNCH & Nutrition Program, Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department

4. Background of the case is that IRMNCH & Nutrition Program, Punjab invited applications for prequalification of Management & Operations of Rural Ambulance Service from eligible firms and advertised on 17-02-2019 in the daily newspaper and on PPRA web site on 19-02-2019 and website of department and program. A corrigendum was uploaded on PPRA website on 20-02-2019 and on websites of Department, Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department & IRMNCH & NP Program. In response there to, 05 firms submitted prequalification applications that were received and opened on 05-03-2019.
5. Out of total 05 firms, No one was prequalified in Prequalification Evaluation Report. The finalized prequalification evaluation report was published on the official websites of the IRMNCH & Nutrition Program Punjab & Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department Punjab on 15-03-2019. Against the Prequalification Evaluation Report, Grievances were received from aggrieved applicants up to 25-03-2019 which were placed before the Grievance Redressal Committee for decision.
6. The case wise proceedings of the meeting are as follows.

Sr. No	Name & Address of the Firm	Item	Reason of Rejection	Grievance of the Applicant Firm	DECISIONS OF THE GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE
1	M/s Capital Car Rental (Pvt.) Ltd.	Operations and Maintenance of Rural Ambulances	The firm does not comply with the knock down clauses No. 03, 06, 10, 13 & 14.	<p>The firm stated that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SOP of fleet management, operation, skills of staff and system (HSE) attached. • GST registration certificate attached. • Technical and managerial staff list attached • Audited financials mentioning turnover more than 500 million attached 	<p>Mr. Tahir Javaid from M/s Capital Car Rental (Pvt.) Ltd attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. Detail of SOP of fleet management, operation, skills of staff and system (HSE), GST registration certificate, Technical and managerial staff list & Audit Balance Sheet provided by the firm.</p> <p>The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail that average annual turnover for last three years is not complied and less than the financial limit (turnover) as per evaluation criteria, so upheld the decision of technical evaluation committee and the status of the firm is still declared as “Not Prequalified”.</p>

Sr. No	Name & Address of the Firm	Item/Status	Reason of Rejection	Grievance of the Applicant Firm	DECISIONS OF THE GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE
2	M/s Mystic Tours Pvt. Ltd.	Management and Operational Services of Rural Ambulances	The firm does not comply with the knock down clauses No. 03 & 14.	<p>The firm stated that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SOP of fleet management and operation attached. • Skills of Staff and system details attached. 	<p>Mr.Mudassir from M/s Mystic Tours Pvt. Ltd attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. Detail of SOP of fleet management and operation and Skills of Staff and system details provided by the firm.</p> <p>The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail and decided that the grievance submitted by the firm is hereby accepted and the status of the firm is declared as “Prequalified”.</p>

Sr. No	Name & Address of the Firm	Item/Status	Reason of Rejection	Grievance of the Applicant Firm	DECISIONS OF THE GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE
3	M/s Al-Hussaini & Company (pvt.) Ltd.	Management and Operational Services of Rural Ambulances	The firm does not comply with the knock down clauses No. 02, 13 & 17.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • M/s Al-Hussaini & Company (Pvt.) Ltd. Is a full featured multi-disciplinary Fleet Managers are in charge for running an organization's vehicle fleet. Job duties of a Fleet Manager include scheduling service, recruiting and coordinating staff, ensuring vehicle security and fleet availability, maintaining database, purchasing vehicles, registering new vehicles to the existing fleet, and preparing annual budgets. Another Fleet Manager responsibility is taking part in educational program and workshops to update technical and professional knowledge. • We are not accept your Evaluation Report for Pre-Qualification, we are not satisfied our already documents is attached I will be sending you conformity certificate & Fleet Management Certificate & our Company Turnover 500/millions in FY 2016, 2017 and 2018. • I really hope for your confirmation of this proposal and let us join hands to push your advocacy for the benefit of the youth of today. Thank you and God Bless. 	<p>Mr. Pitras from M/s Al-Hussaini & Company (pvt.) Ltd attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The firm provided requisite documents.</p> <p>The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail that average annual turnover for last three years is not complied and less than the financial limit (turnover) as per evaluation criteria and no past experience as per criteria, so upheld the decision of technical evaluation committee and the status of the firm is still declared as “Not Prequalified”.</p>

Sr. No	Name & Address of the Firm	Item/Status	Reason of Rejection	Grievance of the Applicant Firm	DECISIONS OF THE GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE
4	M/s United Transport Service	Management and Operational Services of Rural Ambulances	The firm does not comply with the knock down clause No. 15	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Our firm (Unite Transport Services) has been disqualified on the basis that Firm did not comply with knock down clause No. 15 which states that “Operational controls (Tracking/Central Command & Control System) of the firm”, however, the same thing has also been asked in Planning Operational Strategy. In response of this clause we have submitted Implementation Plan and Operational Strategy and copy of Agreement signed with Tracker Company (as all our vehicles are equipped with trackers). • In addition to above, 03 separate knockdown clauses (03, 09 & 15) have been mentioned which looks similar (3) SOP of Fleet Management & Operations (9) Satisfactory Planning Operational Strategy (15) Operational Control of the Firm. We fulfill all the clauses and submitted the required documents (attached herewith) and our firm meet all the requirements of pre-qualification documents, therefore, our firm may please be qualified. Please also clarify, if there is any additional information is required, we will provide the same. • It is therefore, requested to kindly consider our request and approve / accept our pre-qualification documents for the mentioned tender. 	<p>Mr.Babar from M/s United Transport Service attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. Firm submitted Implementation Plan and Operational Strategy and copy of Agreement signed with Tracker Company (as all our vehicles are equipped with trackers). The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail and decided that the grievance submitted by the firm is hereby accepted and the status of the firm is declared as “Prequalified”.</p>

Meeting ended with the vote of thanks by the chair.