

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE GRIEVANCE REDRESSAL COMMITTEE HELD ON 16-04-2019.AT 1530hrs TO REDRESS THE GRIEVANCES OF THE BIDDERS, AS PER RULE 67 OF PUNJAB PROCUREMENT RULES, 2014 (AMENDED), FOR PROCUREMENT SURGICAL DISPOSABLES (Phase-II) FY 2018-19.

A meeting of the Grievance Redressal Committee was held on 16-04-2019 at 1530hrs in committee room of Director General Health Service Punjab, 24-Cooper Road, Lahore to redress the grievances of the bidders, as per Rule 67 of Punjab Procurement Rules, 2014, for procurement of Surgical Disposables (Phase-II) for Financial Year 2018-19. The Director General Health Services, Punjab chaired the meeting.

2. Following members of Grievance Redressal Committee attended the meeting:

1	The Director General Health Services, Government of the Punjab, Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department	In-Chair
2	The Program Director, IRMNCH & Nutrition Program, Government of the Punjab, Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department	Member
3	The Co-opted Member O/o the Director General Health Services, Government of the Punjab, Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department	Member

3. Following members of the Bid/Technical Evaluation Committee presented the case to the grievance redressal committee:

1	The Additional Director (Procurement), IRMNCH & Nutrition Program, Government of the Punjab, Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department
2	The Prequalification Specialist-I, Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department
3	Logistics Officer IRMNCH & Nutrition Program, Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department

4. Background of the case is that IRMNCH & Nutrition Program, Punjab invited bids for procurement of Medicines/Surgical Disposables (Phase-II) through advertisement in national press on 25.01.2019 & websites of Department, Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department and Punjab Procurement Regularity Authority. The process was initiated for the recommended list of essential Medicines and Surgical Disposables required for IRMNCH & Nutrition Program, Punjab. In response there to, Total 40 bids (Medicines & Surgical/Disposables) were received and opened on 11-02-2019. Grievances of Medicines firms has already been addressed on 06-03-2019 against the said tender.

5. The finalized technical evaluation report (Surgical/Disposables items) was uploaded on the official websites of the IRMNCH & Nutrition Program Punjab, & Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department Punjab on 01-03-2019. Against the Technical Evaluation Report, Grievances were received from aggrieved bidders up to 10-03-2019 which were placed before the Grievance Redressal Committee for decision.

5. The case wise proceedings of the meeting are as follows:

Sr. No.	Name of the Firm	Item/Status	Reason of Rejection	Grievance of the Applicant Firm	Decision of the Committee
1.	M/s B Braun Pakistan (pvt) Ltd The Forum, Suite 216, Khayaban-e-Jami, Clifton Block 9 Karachi.	IV Cannula with Injection Port and integrated closing cone size 18G/ Non-Responsive	Free Sale Certificate is not for quoted brand.	The firm stated that: We have attached free sales certificate of mentioned product in our bid against, which we have not being awarded relevant marks and declared non responsive, therefore your requested to please recheck our bid for the said document whereas we have attached another copy of required document (Free sales Certificate). You are reverentially requested to please accept our documents as a part of our submitted bid, in order to ensure a healthy and qualitative competition.	Mr. Rehan from M/s B Braun Pakistan (pvt) Ltd attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The firm provided Free Sale Certificate of quoted brand to the committee. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail and decided that the grievance submitted by the firm is hereby accepted. Now the status of the firm is declared as " Responsive ".
2.	M/s B Braun Pakistan (pvt) Ltd The Forum, Suite 216, Khayaban-e-Jami, Clifton Block 9 Karachi.	IV Cannula with Injection Port and integrated closing cone size 20G/ Non-Responsive	Free Sale Certificate is not for quoted brand.	The firm stated that: We have attached free sales certificate of mentioned product in our bid against, which we have not being awarded relevant marks and declared non responsive, therefore your requested to please recheck our bid for the said document whereas we have attached another copy of required document (Free sales Certificate). You are reverentially requested to please accept our documents as a part of our submitted bid, in order to ensure a healthy and qualitative competition.	Mr. Rehan from M/s B Braun Pakistan (pvt) Ltd attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The firm provided Free Sale Certificate of quoted brand to the committee. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail and decided that the grievance submitted by the firm is hereby accepted. Now the status of the firm is declared as " Responsive ".
3.	M/s B Braun Pakistan (pvt) Ltd The Forum, Suite 216, Khayaban-e-Jami, Clifton Block 9 Karachi.	IV Cannula with Injection Port and integrated closing cone size 20G & 18G/ Non-Responsive	The firm submitted a grievance against the other evaluated brand i.e. Bicacilar from M/s Usman Co International	The firm stated that: The technical committee has evaluated other brand, which was technically rejected from various teaching institutions and was not even considered eligible to be prequalified for DG Health Lahore tender.	Mr. Rehan from M/s B Braun Pakistan (pvt) Ltd attended the meeting and presented grievance against the already responsive firm M/s Usmanco International that a number of complaints have been reported & not even considered eligible to be prequalified for DG Health Lahore. Committee called the

Sr. No.	Name of the Firm	Item/Status	Reason of Rejection	Grievance of the Applicant Firm	Decision of the Committee
				<p>The evaluated brand has a number of complaints like leakage, multiple pricks, pain on insertion site and rolling back of catheter that may cause severe vein rupture and other problem which have been reported. Moreover you are informed that other evaluated brand do not have company logo anywhere on the product which creates a doubt of repacking.</p> <p>Sir, I would like to submit that our brand Vasofix is considered as drug of choice by doctors and paramedical staff and it also has a history in all leading institutions since years, moreover IV Cannula come s under the life saving product in all treatments and drug delivery system protect sensitive skin and delicate veins that may be ruptured by sub-standard IV catheter. Furthermore, Vasofix offers indwelling time of 3 days therefore is more economical than others at 1/3 price due to optical transparency, heat resistance, flexibility & softness.</p>	<p>representative of M/s Usmanco International. Mr.Iftikhar Shah from M/s UsmanCo attended the meeting and presented that a number of award letters and purchase orders have been awarded for the current and previous years from health departments, Furthermore he requested that end users recommendation form technical committee approved the brand "Bicakcilar", I.V cannula. Further he provided the copies of import trails. He briefed that due to non-compliance of financial limit in criteria of DGHS, the firm did not prequalify. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail and decided that the grievance submitted by the firm M/s B.Braun is hereby rejected as M/s UsmanCo fulfills all the requisite parameters of evaluation criteria and also fulfills end users recommendations, so upheld the decision of technical evaluation committee for healthy competition and the status of the firm M/s UsmanCo International is still declared as "Responsive".</p>
4.	The Searle Company Limited. First Floor, N.I.C.L Building Abbasi Shaheed Road. Karachi.	IV Cannula with Injection Port and integrated closing cone size 18G/ Non-Responsive	Free Sale Certificate is not for quoted brand. Rejected from End User.	<p>The firm stated that:</p> <p>It is requested that our product is already technically approved with same specification in various Govt. institutes including</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Director General Health Services 2. DHQ Teaching Hospital Sargodha 3. Govt. Teaching Hospital Kot Khawaja Saeed Hospital, Lahore <p>Please Re-review our samples and we attached valid free sale certificate and technical reports and purchase orders for the</p>	<p>Mr. Umair Idrees from M/s The Searle Company Limited attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report.</p> <p>The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail and decided that the grievance submitted by the firm is hereby rejected as Free Sale Certificate is not for</p>

Sr. No.	Name of the Firm	Item/Status	Reason of Rejection	Grievance of the Applicant Firm	Decision of the Committee
				reference with this letter. Kindly accept our grievance on above clarification. We are very thankful to you for your cooperation.	quoted brand. And also sample is rejected from End User, so upheld the decision of technical evaluation committee and the status of the firm is still declared as “Non-Responsive” .
5.	The Searle Company Limited. First Floor, N.I.C.L Building Abbasi Shaheed Road. Karachi.	IV Cannula with Injection Port and integrated closing cone size 20G/ Non-Responsive	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Free Sale Certificate is not for quoted brand. • Rejected from End User. 	<p>The firm stated that:</p> <p>It is requested that our product is already technically approved with same specification in various Govt. institutes including</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Director General Health Services 2. DHQ Teaching Hospital Sargodha 3. Govt. Teaching Hospital Kot Khawaja Saeed Hospital, Lahore <p>Please Re-review our samples and we attached valid free sale certificate and technical reports and purchase orders for the reference with this letter. Kindly accept our grievance on above clarification. We are very thankful to you for your cooperation.</p>	<p>Mr. Umair Idrees from M/s The Searle Company Limited attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report.</p> <p>The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail and decided that the grievance submitted by the firm is hereby rejected as Free Sale Certificate is not for quoted brand. And also sample is rejected from End User, so upheld the decision of technical evaluation committee and the status of the firm is still declared as “Non-Responsive”.</p>
6.	The Searle Company Limited. First Floor, N.I.C.L Building Abbasi Shaheed Road. Karachi.	Drip/ IV Set/ Non-Responsive	Obtained Marks are less than Minimum Passing Marks i.e, 36/60	<p>The firm stated that:</p> <p>It is requested that we already attached undertaking regarding batch substandard and we also attached international experience regarding product. Our bid is over look documents which are missing according to technical evaluation report are attached with our bid. Kindly accept our grievance on above clarification. We are very thankful to you for your cooperation.</p>	<p>Mr. Umair Idrees from M/s The Searle Company Limited attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report, the firm provided declaration of quality of product from DTL/NIH.</p> <p>The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail and the firm awarded 10 marks in affidavit of</p>

Sr. No.	Name of the Firm	Item/Status	Reason of Rejection	Grievance of the Applicant Firm	Decision of the Committee
					<p>declaration of quality of product now the firm obtained 40 marks out of 60 and committee decided that the grievance submitted by the firm is hereby accepted. Now the status of the firm is declared as “Responsive”.</p>
7.	<p>M/s Nisa Impex (Pvt.) Ltd. Maxim Arcade, Plot # 13-14, Usman Block, Jaddah Town, Phase-I, Opp. DHA-II, G.T Road, Islamabad.</p>	<p>Drip/ IV Set/Non-Responsive</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bid Security Amount Hidden • Free Sale certificate in not for quoted Brand • Rejected from End User 	<p>The firm stated that: Original CDR attached with Financial Bid You can verify from http://www.xishifeng.com/goods/id/32.html our Brand is Nisa.</p>	<p>Mr. Ijaz Kan from M/s Nisa Impex (Pvt.) Ltd attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. He briefed that bid security is attached with financial bid and provided free sale certificate of quoted brand.</p> <p>The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail and decided that the grievance submitted by the firm is hereby rejected as sample is rejected from End User, so upheld the decision of technical evaluation committee and the status of the firm is still declared as “Non-Responsive”.</p>
8.	<p>M/s Cotton Craft (Pvt) Ltd. 12-Km Multan Road, Canal View Society Lahore</p>	<p>Sterile Guaze/ Non-Responsive</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Attached Stamp paper are of Rs. 50/- instead of Rs. 100/-. 	<p>The firm stated that: Sir we have inadvertently attached stamp papers of Rs. 50/- Instead of Rs. 100 along with our Technical Offer. Please find enclosed herewith undertaking regarding Not Black Listing and undertaking that not a single batch has been declared substandard/Spurious/Adulterated catch by</p>	<p>Grievance of M/s Cotton Craft (Pvt) Ltd. received and submitted to grievance redressal committee. However, no representative from the firm attended the meeting. The committee examined the grievance in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The firm provided required stamp paper with grievance application.</p>

Sr. No.	Name of the Firm	Item/Status	Reason of Rejection	Grievance of the Applicant Firm	Decision of the Committee
				<p>DTLs of the Punjab/ any competent Lab of quoted/applied item on judicial paper of Rs. 100/- duly attested by the Notary Public.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As per marking criteria of Medical Devices as Manufacturer we are qualified as our marks are 30 out of 45. The Required Marks are 27. <p>In the light of above mentioned provided documents. It is requested to please revalidate our technical offer for healthy competition and in the best interest of needy peoples. Your cooperation in this regard will be much appreciated.</p>	<p>The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail and decided that the grievance submitted by the firm is hereby accepted as firm has obtained required passing marks. Now the status of the firm is declared as “Responsive”.</p>

Meeting ended with the vote of thanks by the chair